

**Letter to the Editor—Commentary on Authors' Response,
Alexander et al.**

Sir:

The authors obscure the fact that our letter was submitted in May 2005, while our article was published in October 2005. In the interim, an important paper (1) was published in July 2005 that replicated the findings of the European Concerted Action on SIDS (ECAS) study (2) cited in our initial comments and led us to modify our views on the safety of bedsharing. They also misrepresent our article (3), which was not a study of sudden infant death syndrome (SIDS) risks but a study of whether or not smoking mothers are getting the message that they should not bedshare. Our comments on the safety for infants at least 11 weeks old of bedsharing with nonsmoking mothers was clearly stated to be based not on our own research, but on the published scientific evidence. Finally, without denominator (control) data, the authors cannot test their marketing slogan that infants should sleep "alone, supine, and in a crib"; the fact that the authors found that SIDS is rare in the setting of an infant sleeping "alone, supine, and in a

crib" sheds absolutely no light on the risks of bedsharing without denominator (control) data.

References

1. Tappin D, Ecob R, Brooke H. Bedsharing, roomsharing, and sudden infant death syndrome in Scotland: a case-control study. *J Pediatr* 2005;147:32-7.
2. Carpenter RG, Irgens LM, Blair PS, England PD, Fleming P, Huber J, et al. Sudden unexplained infant death in 20 regions in Europe: case control study. *Lancet* 2004;363:185-91.
3. Lahr MB, Rosenberg KD, Lapidus JA. Bedsharing and maternal smoking in a population-based survey of new mothers. *Pediatrics* 2005;116:e530-42. <http://pediatrics.aappublications.org/cgi/reprint/116/4/e530>

Martin B. Lahr, M.D., M.P.H.
Disability Determination Services
Oregon Department of Human Services
Salem, OR 97305

Kenneth D. Rosenberg, M.D., M.P.H.
Office of Family Health
Oregon Department of Human Services
Portland, OR 97232